BACT Determination Number: 135 BACT Determination Date: 3/3/2017

Equipment Information

Permit Number: N/A -- Generic BACT Determination

Equipment Description: BOILER

Unit Size/Rating/Capacity: >= 75,000 Btu/hr and < 2.0 MMBTU/hr fired on LPG

Equipment Location:

BACT Determination Information

ROCs	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
RUUS	Technology	
	Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Practice
NOx	Standard:	77 ppm for < 400,000 Btu/hr; all others 30 ppm
	Technology Description:	Low NOx burner with good combustion practices
	Basis:	Achieved in Practice
SOx	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Practice
PM10	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
3	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Practice
PM2.5	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Practice
СО	Standard:	400 ppm >= 400,000 Btu/hr; others good combustion
	Technology Description:	Low NOx burner with good combustion practices
	Basis:	Achieved in Practice
LEAD	Standard:	
	Technology	
	Description:	
	Basis:	

Comments: All units listed ppm are ppmvd corrected to 3% O2

District Contact: Joe Carle Phone No.: (916) 874 - 4838 email: jcarle@airquality.org

Printed: 3/7/2018



BEST AVAILABLE CONTROL TECHNOLOGY DETERMINATION

DETERMINATION NO.: 135

DATE: 1/25/17

ENGINEER: Joe Carle

Category/General Equip Description: Boilers/Heaters – LPG

Boilers/Heaters Greater or Equal to 75,000 BTU/hr

Equipment Specific Description: and Less than 2.0 MMBTU/hr, Fired on LPG

Equipment Size/Rating: Small Emitter BACT (PTE < 10 lb/day)

Previous BACT Det. No.: 112

This BACT determination will update Determination #112 for boilers/heaters greater or equal to 75,000 BTU/hr and less than 2.0 MMBtu/hr, fired on Liquid Petroleum Gas (LPG/Propane). The Determination #112 did not consider differences in LPG/propane and natural gas combustion burner technology and rules applicability at various districts pertaining to units fired on natural gas only. This BACT determination will clarify those differences.

BACT ANALYSIS

A: ACHIEVED IN PRACTICE (Rule 202, §205.1a)

The following control technologies are currently employed as BACT for boilers/heaters greater or equal to 75,000 BTU/hr and less than 2.0 MMBTU/hr, fired on LPG/propane fuel, by the following air pollution control districts:

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements		
	BACT Source: EPA RACT/BACT/LAER Clearinghouse		
	For units with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr		
	VOC	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range	
	NOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range	
US EPA	SOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range	
	PM10	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range	
	PM2.5	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range	
	СО	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range	
	RULE RE	EQUIREMENTS:	

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements				
	BACT Source: ARB BACT Clearinghouse				
	For units with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr				
	voc	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	NOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
ARB	SOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	PM10	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	PM2.5	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	СО	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	RULE REQUIREMENTS: None				
	BACT Source: S	SMAQMD BACT Clearinghouse			
	For units with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr				
	voc	VOC Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not available.			
	NOx	Pool/spa heaters: 55 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ All other boilers/heaters: 20 ppmvd at 3% O2			
	SOx	Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not available.			
	PM10	Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not available.			
SMAQMD	PM2.5	Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not available.			
	СО	400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ , Burner technology controlling NOx as a priority			
	*Note: Despite this BACT determination being done for both natural gas and LPG it was discovered that natural gas and LPG do not conform to the same standards and therefore this BACT determination is not applicable to LPG units. RULE REQUIREMENTS:				
	Rule 414 - Water Heaters, Boilers And Process Heaters Rated Less Than 1,000,000 BTU Per Hour				
	LPG units are exempt from standards.				
	Rule 411 - NOx from Boilers, Process Heaters and Steam Generators For units with a rating of ≥ 1 MMBtu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr fired on natural gas or LPG. 30 ppmvd of NOx corrected to 3% O ₂ 400 ppmvd of CO corrected to 3% O ₂				

District/Agency	Best Ava	ilable Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements		
	Note: SC MMBtu/h SCAQME SCAQME Written pothat has a are equip	SCAQMD BACT Guidelines for Non-Major Polluting Facilities (AQMD BACT Guidelines do not contain a determination for boilers/heaters 2 or or less, since these units are not required to obtain a written permit, pursuant to D Rule 219. D Rule 219(b)(2) The ermits are not required for boilers, process heaters, or any combustion equipment a rated maximum heat input capacity of 2,000,000 Btu per hour (gross) or less and ped to be heated exclusively with natural gas, methanol, liquefied petroleum gas, mbination thereof.		
South Coast	ļ <u> </u>	s with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr		
AQMD	VOC	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	NOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	SOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	PM10	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	PM2.5	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	СО	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
Bay Area AQMD	BACT Source: BAAQMD BACT Guideline Note: BAAQMD BACT Guidelines do not contain a determination for boiler 10 MMBtu/hr or less fired exclusively on natural gas or LPG, since these u required to obtain a written permit, pursuant to BAAQMD Regulation 2, Ru BAAQMD Rule 2-1-114 The following equipment is exempt from the, requirements of Sections 2-1 (requirement to obtain an ATC or PTO): (114.1) Boilers, Heaters, Steam GDuct Burners, and Similar Combustion Equipment: 1.2 Any of the above equipment with less than 10 million BTU per hour rate if fired exclusively with natural gas (including compressed natural gas), liquipetroleum gas (e.g. propane, butane, isobutane, propylene, butylenes, and mixtures), or any combination thereof.			
	For units	s with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr		
	voc	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	NOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	SOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	PM10	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	PM2.5	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	СО	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	RULE REQUIREMENTS: None			

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements			
	BACT Source: NSR Requirements for BACT Note: SDCAPCD BACT Guidelines do not contain a determination for boilers/heaters 5 MMBtu/hr or less, since these units are not required to obtain a written permit, pursuant to SDAPCD Rule 11. SDAPCD Rule 11(d) Any equipment, operation, or process that is listed below in Subsections (d)(1) through (d)(20), and that meets the stated exemption provision, parameter, requirement, or limitation, is exempt from the requirements of Rule 10. (d)(2)(v) Any boiler, process heater, or steam generator with a manufacturer's maximum gross heat input rating of less than 5 million BTU per hour fired exclusively with natural gas and/or liquefied petroleum gas.			
	For units	s with a rating of 75,000 Btu	/hr to < 2 MMRtu/hr	
	VOC	·		75 to <2 MMBtu/hr range
	NOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	SOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	PM10	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
San Diego	PM2.5	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
County APCD	СО	N/A – No BACT determina	ations found in the ≥ 0.07	75 to <2 MMBtu/hr range
	RULE REQUIREMENTS: Regulation 4, Rule 69.2.1 – Small Boilers, Process Heaters, and Steam Generators			
	Emission Limits (Effective on or after March 25, 2010)			
	Type of equipment and size, in MMBtu/hr		NOx	СО
	IVIVIBLU/III		ppmvd	ppmvd
	Units ≥ 0.6 and ≤ 2.0, except as below, fired on gaseous fuel (D)		30	400
	Units ≥ 0.6 and ≤ 2.0, except as below, fired on liquid fuel		40	400
	Units < 0.6		Rule not applicable	Rule not applicable
	(B) This mate (C) This equip	rial being heated is in direct	ces, kilns, and any comb contact with the product	ustion equipment where the ts of combustion. ciated waste heat recovery

Г	1				
District/Agency	Best Ava	ilable Control Technology (I	BACT)/Requirements		
	Note: SJV MMBtu/h to SJUVA SJVUAPO No Author generator closed in 5,000,000	APCD Rule 2020. CD Rule 2020 §6.0 prity to Construct or Permit to rs, steam superheaters, wan direct heat transfer systems to Btu per hour (gross) or less) natural gas, (§6.1.1.2) liqu	do not contain a determ are not required to obtain to Operate shall be requiter boilers, water heaters that have a maximum is and is equipped to be	red for (§6.1) steam s, steam cleaners, and nput heat rating of fired exclusively with	
	For unit	s with a rating of 75,000 Btu	ı/hr to < 2 MMRtu/hr		
	VOC			75 to <2 MMBtu/hr range	
	VOCN/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr rangeNOxN/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	SOx N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	PM10 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	PM2.5 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	CO N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
San Joaquin Valley APCD	RULE REQUIREMENTS: SJVUAPCD Rule 4308 – Boilers, Steam Generators, and Process Heaters – 0.075 MMBtu/hr to less than 2.0 MMBtu/hr Emission Limits (Effective on or after January 1, 2015)				
	Lillission	TEITHS (Effective of or arc		20/ O2\	
	Type and Size of Unit, in MMBtu/hr		NOx Limit (corrected to		
			PUC Gas	Non-PUC Gas or Liquid	
			lb/MMBtu of heat input (ppmvd)	lb/MMBtu of heat input (ppmvd)	
	Units ≥ 0.075 and ≤ 0.4, except as below		0.024 (20)	0.093 (77)	
	Units > 0.4 and < 2.0, except as below		0.024 (20)	0.036 (30)	
	Instantaneous water heaters ≥ 0.075 and ≤ 0.4		0.024 (20)	0.093 (77)	
	Instantaneous water heaters >0.4 and <2.0		0.024 (20)	0.036 (30)	
	Pool heaters ≥ 0.075 and ≤ 0.4		0.068 (55)	0.093 (77)	
	Pool hea	aters > 0.4 and < 2.0	0.024 (20)	0.036 (30)	
		with a rating of ≥ 0.4 MMBt I to 3% O ₂	u/hr and < 2.0 MMBtu/hr	: 400 ppmvd of CO	

The following control technologies have been identified and are ranked based on stringency:

	SUMMARY OF ACHIEVED IN PRACTICE CONTROL TECHNOLOGIES				
voc	1.No standard [SMAQMD, SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]				
NOx	 Boilers/heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: 77 ppmvd at 3% O₂ Boilers/heaters ≥ 400,000 Btu/hr: 30 ppmvd at 3% O₂ – [SJVUAPCD] Boilers/heaters < 600,000 Btu/hr: no standard Boilers/heaters ≥ 600,000 Btu/hr: 30 ppmvd at 3% O₂ – [SDCAPCD] Boilers/heaters < 1 MMBtu/hr: no standard Boilers/heaters ≥ 1 MMBtu/hr: 30 ppmvd at 3% O₂ – [SMAQMD] No standard – [SCAQMD, BAAQMD] 				
SOx	1.No standard [SMAQMD, SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]				
PM10	1.No standard [SMAQMD, SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]				
PM2.5	1.No standard [SMAQMD, SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]				
СО	1.Boilers/heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: no standard All other boilers/heaters: 400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ – [SJVUAPCD] 2.Boilers/heaters < 600,000 Btu/hr: no standard All other boilers/heaters: 400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ – [SDCAPCD] 3.Boilers/heaters < 1 MMBtu/hr: no standard All other boilers/heaters: 400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ – [SDCAPCD] 4.No standard – [SCAQMD, BAAQMD]				

The following control technologies have been identified as the most stringent, achieved in practice control technologies:

BEST CONTROL TECHNOLOGIES ACHIEVED			
Pollutant	Standard	Source	
VOC	No standard		
NOx	Boilers/heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: 77 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ Boilers/heaters ≥ 400,000 Btu/hr: 30 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SJVUAPCD (Rule 4308)	
SOx	No standard		
PM10	No standard		
PM2.5	No standard		
СО	Boilers/heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: no standard All other boilers/heaters: 400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SJVUAPCD (Rule 4308)	

B. TECHNOLOGICALLY FEASIBLE AND COST EFFECTIVE (Rule 202, §205.1.b.):

Technologically Feasible Alternatives:

Any alternative basic equipment, fuel, process, emission control device or technique, singly or in combination, determined to be technologically feasible by the Air Pollution Control Officer.

The table below shows the technologically feasible alternatives identified as capable of reducing emissions beyond the levels determined to be "Achieved in Practice" as per Rule 202, §205.1.a.

Pollutant	Technologically Feasible Alternative
voc	Good combustion practices
NOx	Selective Catalytic Reduction (SCR) Flue Gas Recirculation (FGR) with a Low-NOx burner
SOx	Good combustion practices
PM10	Good combustion practices
PM2.5	Good combustion practices
СО	Good combustion practices

Cost Effective Determination

After identifying the technologically feasible control options, a cost analysis is performed to take into consideration economic impacts for all technologically feasible controls identified.

Maximum Cost per Ton of Air Pollutants Controlled

A control technology is considered to be cost-effective if the cost of controlling one ton of that air pollutant is less than the limits specified below (except coating operations):

Pollutant	Maximum Cost (\$/ton)
ROG	17,500
NO_X	24,500
PM10	11,400
SO _X	18,300
CO	TBD if BACT triggered

Selective Catalytic Reduction:

Typically selective catalytic reduction (SCR) can be used to reduce emissions from larger boilers. SCR requires ammonia or urea for NOx reduction and units of this size range are typically used in residences and service/commercial applications where storage of these materials is impractical and could pose a health risk. Additionally, SCR is designed for industrial units that run full time and can maintain a temperature that the catalyst requires for NOx reduction, whereas smaller units are turned on and off throughout the day and cannot maintain the required temperatures. Finally, SCR systems require frequent maintenance for operation which may not be practical in a residential or small service/commercial setting.

District Staff has done an analysis¹ for using SCR on a boiler rated at 20 MMBTU/hr and the cost effectiveness was \$53,084 per ton of NOx reduced. As the rating of the unit goes down the total emission reduction will decrease while cost will stay relatively equivalent and therefore the cost effectiveness will increase. Therefore, SCR is not only technologically infeasible for this size range of boilers/heaters but it is also not cost effective and is eliminated as a control option. Although this analysis was done for a natural gas boiler it would still apply to LPG boilers/heaters.

Flue Gas Recirculation with a Low-NOx Burner:

Adding flue gas recirculation (FGR) to a smaller unit would result in minimal additional reductions when paired with a low-NOx burner, and would cost more than a low-NOx burner alone. Like SCR,

¹ SMAQMD, "BACT Determination: Boilers/Heaters ≥5 and <20 MMBTU/hr fired on natural gas or LPG," June 3,2015

BACT Determination
Boiler/Heater ≥ 75,000 BTU/hr and < 2.0 MMBTU/hr, Fired on LPG
January 25, 2017
Page 8 of 8

the system requires frequent maintenance for operation which may not be practical in a residential or small service/commercial setting. The BAAQMD did an analysis of adding FGR to a boiler in the 400,000 to 2,000,000 Btu/hr range in their 2007 Staff Report for Regulation 9, Rule 6 and found that the incremental cost effectiveness of adding FGR over a low-NOx burner is estimated at \$60,000 per ton of NOx reduced. Therefore, FGR added to a boiler/heater with a low-NOx burner is not cost effective and is eliminated as a control option. Despite the analysis being done for natural gas boilers it would still apply to LPG boilers/heaters.

Good Combustion Practice:

Owners/operators of boilers/heaters should be maintaining good combustion practices as part of proper operation of a boiler/heater and requiring good combustion practices to continue would not add any additional costs. Therefore, because these requirements would not add any additional cost it is a valid control option.

C. SELECTION OF BACT:

Because no other technically feasible alternatives are available for the size range of these boilers/heaters BACT for NOx and CO will remain at what is currently achieved in practice. BACT for VOC, SOx, PM10, and PM2.5 will now be considered good combustion practices since this was shown to be feasible.

BACT for Boilers/Heaters ≥ 75,000 Btu/hr and < 2.0 MMBtu/hr Fired on LPG			
Pollutant	Standard	Source	
VOC	Good combustion practices		
NOx	Boilers/heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: 77 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ Boilers/heaters ≥ 400,000 Btu/hr: 30 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SJVUAPCD (Rule 4308)	
SOx	Good combustion practices		
PM10	Good combustion practices		
PM2.5	Good combustion practices		
СО	Boilers/heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: good combustion practices Boilers/heaters ≥ 400,000 Btu/hr: 400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SJVUAPCD (Rule 4308)	

D. SELECTION OF T-BACT:

Toxics are in the form of VOCs and particulate matter. Since toxic emission from propane fired boilers in the 2 MMBtu/hr or less size range are so small and the cancer risk is not expected to be anywhere close to 1 in a million cases, T-BACT was not evaluated for this determination.

REVIEWED BY:	DATE:		
APPROVED BY:	DATE:		